

Comparative Analysis of Anti-Capitalist Narratives in Hizb ut-Tahrir Movements in Indonesia and Malaysia

Hasbi Aswar

Universitas Islam Indonesia, Yogyakarta
Email: hasbiaswar@uii.ac.id

Abstract: This study explores the narrative of anti-capitalism through the perspective of Islamic political movements by comparing the Hizb ut-Tahrir movement in Indonesia and Malaysia. Capitalism has been a global topic of conversation with diverse impacts on societies, both positive and negative. However, criticism has emerged due to the various damages and social impacts experienced in different countries. This research investigates how Hizb ut-Tahrir in Indonesia and Malaysia responds to the effects of capitalism in their respective countries through the lens of Islamic ideology. The study employs a qualitative approach with comparative analysis techniques, utilizing data collected from documents and literature related to the Hizb ut-Tahrir movement in both countries. The results reveal that Hizb ut-Tahrir in Indonesia and Malaysia views capitalism as a system incompatible with Islamic principles. They critique the capitalist system for fostering injustice, inequality, and the oppression of marginalized populations. Additionally, Hizb ut-Tahrir in Indonesia and Malaysia propose alternative Islamic-based economic systems to solve global economic problems.

Keywords: *Anti-Capitalism Narrative, Islamic Political Movement, Hizb ut-Tahrir Indonesia – Malaysia.*

Abstrak: Kajian ini akan membahas tentang narasi anti-kapitalisme melalui perspektif gerakan politik Islam dengan melakukan perbandingan antara gerakan Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia dan Malaysia. Kapitalisme telah menjadi sebuah bahan perbincangan global sampai saat ini dengan berbagai dampak yang dihasilkannya baik dari sisi yang positif maupun negatifnya. Namun, berbagai kritikan muncul sebab berbagai kerusakan dan dampak sosial yang terjadi di berbagai negara. Kajian ini mencoba melihat bagaimana Hizbut Tahrir di dua negara merespon dampak kapitalisme di dua negara mereka masing-masing melalui kacamata ideologis Islam yang mereka perjuangkan. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif dengan teknik analisis komparatif. Data dikumpulkan dari dokumen dan literatur terkait gerakan Hizbut Tahrir di kedua negara. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia dan Malaysia memandang kapitalisme sebagai sistem yang tidak sesuai dengan prinsip-prinsip Islam. Mereka mengkritik sistem kapitalisme karena menghasilkan ketidakadilan, ketimpangan, dan penindasan terhadap rakyat kecil. Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia dan Malaysia juga mengusulkan alternatif sistem ekonomi berbasis Islam sebagai solusi atas masalah ekonomi global.

Kata Kunci: *Narasi Anti-Kapitalisme, Gerakan Politik Islam, Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia – Malaysia.*

INTRODUCTION

After the Cold War, globalized and dominant capitalism sparked various spotlights and criticisms from different people. These critics come from a wide range of ideological spectrums, from supporters of the current system as well as from other ideological movements such as leftist anarchists, including Islamic movements. This criticism of the ideology of capitalism is due to its resulting social, economic, political, and environmental impacts. Capitalism is considered to produce various socioeconomic inequalities in society. Globally, only a few people enjoy the world's wealth, while the majority are only a few. As a result, poverty, malnutrition, unemployment, labor exploitation, and environmental exploitation have become inevitable globally ¹.

In the context of Islamic political movements and resistance to capitalism, according to Valentine M. Moghadam (2009), one of the causes of the emergence of Islam-based resistance movements in Muslim countries is caused by the process of economic restructuring towards neoliberalism/capitalism. This results in various economic problems, such as debt, unemployment, etc. On the other hand, leftist and liberal movements tend to remain silent in authoritarian Islamic world regimes. This paved the way for Islamic leaders to speak out and mobilize the resistance movement against capitalism and its effects ². Vedi Hadiz (2011) also found the same thing related to political Islam and capitalism. Hadiz found that Islamic political movements are referred to as populist responses to the impact of neoliberal capitalism in the Islamic world ³.

Hizbut Tahrir is an international political movement that speaks harshly against capitalism in the world and in Muslim countries. HT was founded in 1948 by Sheikh Taqiuddin An-Nabhani and has since spread to various countries worldwide, including Europe, Asia, Australia, and America. The main message of the movement is to promote Sharia law and the Caliphate as a means to unite Muslims, uphold Islamic law, and spread the religion of Islam globally. Furthermore, this group also calls to leave capitalism, socialism, and other Western

¹ Valentine M. Moghadam, *Globalization and Social Movements Islamism, Feminism, and the Global Justice Movement* (United Kingdom: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2009).

² Moghadam.

³ Vedi R. Hadiz, 'Indonesian Political Islam: Capitalist Development and the Legacies of the Cold War', *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs* 30, no. 1 (2011): 3–38, <https://doi.org/10.1177/186810341103000101>.

ideologies that are considered against Islam⁴. This study will focus on comparing HT's responses from both its branches in Malaysia and Indonesia toward the influence of capitalism in both countries.

As a Global Islamic Social movement, Hizbut Tahrir has been discussed widely by many scholars with different approaches. For instance, Suzanne Olsson (2021) analyzes HT Sweden's narrative on political Islam, Democracy, and the Caliphate. On the one hand, Jan A. Ali & Elisa Orofino (2018) compare HT, Tabligh Jamaat, and Ikhwan al-Muslimun⁵. They see the similarities and differences of the three revivalist movements, which emerged as a reaction to the impact of modernity on the Islamic world. In addition, Iqbal Ahnaf (2017) discussed the change strategy carried out by HTI specifically by examining three stages from development to state implementation, including the culturizing process, interaction with society, and implementation of Islamic shariah through the establishment of Khilafah⁶. In the context of studying HT in Indonesia and Malaysia, Mohamed Nawab Mohamed Osman (2018) specifically conducted studies on HT in the frame of social movements in general with an approach to political opportunity, framing, and mobilization in analyzing HTI history, form of actions and mobilizations and the state responses to this group⁷. In studying HT in Malaysia, Osman (2009) discusses the historical aspect of HT and the strategy of group mobilization in that country⁸.

This study is important to provide an overview of the perspective of Islamic social movements in viewing the ideology of global capitalism and its impact. Most studies of ideological criticism come from the perspective of movements that emerged in the West, such as the environmental movement, feminism, postmodernism, and socialism. On the other hand, the perspective of the Islamic world and its movements is still very limited. Therefore, this

⁴ Hasbi Aswar, 'Destructing The Islamist in Indonesia', *International Journal of Malay-Nusantara Studies* 1, no. 1 (2018): 62–79.

⁵ Jan A. Ali and Elisa Orofino, 'Islamic Revivalist Movements in the Modern World: An Analysis of al-Ikhwan al-Muslimun, Tabligh Jama'at, and Hizb Ut-Tahrir', *Journal for the Academic Study of Religion* 31, no. 1 (2018): 27–54, <https://doi.org/10.1558/jasr.35051>; Susanne Olsson, 'Hizb Ut-Tahrir's Caliphal Counter-Narrative', *Religions* 2021, Vol. 12, Page 486 12, no. 7 (29 June 2021): 486, <https://doi.org/10.3390/REL12070486>.

⁶ Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf, 'Hizb Al-Tahrir: Its Ideology and Theory for Collective Radicalization', in *Expressions of Radicalization: Global Politics, Processes and Practices*, ed. Kristian Steiner and Andreas Önnersfors (Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017), 295–320, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-65566-6_11.

⁷ Mohamed Nawab Mohamed Osman, *Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia and Political Islam: Identity, Ideology and Religio-Political Mobilization*, *Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia and Political Islam: Identity, Ideology and Religio-Political Mobilization* (New York: Routledge, 2018), <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351240222>.

⁸ Mohamed Nawab Mohamed Osman, 'Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia: The Emergence of a New Transnational Islamist Movement in Malaysia', *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 47, no. 1 (26 June 2009): 91–110, <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2009.471.91-110>.

study is important to expand people's thinking about various criticisms of capitalism and its effects.

METHOD

This qualitative research uses a comparative approach, namely comparing HT narratives in Malaysia and Indonesia related to criticism of the implementation of capitalism in both countries. The data sources used in this study are primary and secondary. Primary sources are taken from HT's works from both countries, both written and in the form of online or offline interview manuscripts contained in the media of these two organizations or recorded on social media. Secondary sources are obtained from various existing documents from journals, books, magazine articles, and websites. This study uses a framing approach in the study of social movements.

Framing theory is a tool social movements use to mobilize people to engage in social change activities. This is done by building awareness through identifying problems, providing alternative solutions, and inviting them to fight together⁹. The framing process is divided into three dimensions: diagnostic, prognostic, and motivational. First, the diagnostic dimension is how a movement constructs a societal problem. It usually involves an explanation of the problem and the root of the problem, as well as the actors involved or to blame in the problem. Second, the prognostic dimension is an effort to provide alternatives or solutions to problems presented in the diagnostic dimension. The third dimension is motivation, which is inviting the community to participate in movement activities after explaining the problem and providing solutions. Language – language often used in this dimension, such as emergency/severity, urgency, effectiveness, and feasibility¹⁰.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Hizb ut-Tahrir (HT) is a political movement founded in 1948 in Palestine, and it later became the official party in 1953 in Jordan. HT was established by Sheikh Taqiuddin An-Nabhani, an activist, cleric, and judge in Palestine. An-Nabhani served as the first leader of HT

⁹ Robert D Benford and David A Snow, 'Framing Processes and Social Movements: An Overview and Assessment', *Annual Review of Sociology*, 2000, <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.soc.26.1.611>.

¹⁰ Benford and Snow.

until he died in 1977, after which Sheikh Abdul Qadim Zallum led the movement until 2003. HT is led by Shaykh Khalil bin Abu Rushtah ¹¹.

Hizb ut-Tahrir is an Islamic political party to establish Islam by establishing the Islamic Caliphate. According to HT, this is the only way to uplift Muslims from their current challenges and free them from non-Islamic thoughts, systems, laws, and the influence of non-Islamic countries. The method HT advocates to achieve these objectives is establishing the Islamic Caliphate's rule ¹².

The Caliphate, according to HT, plays a crucial role in ensuring the implementation of Sharia laws among Muslims and conducting da'wah globally. HT looks to the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) and the caliphs who succeeded him as examples¹³.

In pursuing change, as HT desires, the implemented method encompasses three main aspects. First, existing societal thoughts are transformed into Islamic thoughts, making them public opinions among those motivated to implement and follow them. Second, altering the emotions of society to align with Islamic values, accepting only what is pleasing to Allah (SWT), and rebelling against and resenting anything that angers Allah (SWT). Third, societal relationships should be transformed to align with Islamic principles and solutions.

HT believes that all these missionary activities can be categorized as political activities because they are conducted to manage societal affairs following Sharia principles and their resolutions. However, it is important to note that the politics referred to here is not secular politics but rather politics based on Islamic values.

The process of this political struggle is focused on intellectual efforts, involving a struggle against erroneous thoughts and the system of disbelief. This is done by refuting incorrect thoughts, criticizing damaged beliefs, and demonstrating the shortcomings and errors of concepts while explaining Islamic rulings on these matters.

According to HT, political struggle also involves resistance against infidel imperialism. Its main objective is to liberate the people from the dominion of this imperialism and eliminate its influence by uprooting its intellectual, cultural, political, economic, and military roots from Islamic countries. Political struggle is also evident in challenging rulers, exposing their betrayals and conspiracies against the people, and assigning and changing them if they violate

¹¹ Hizb-ut-Tahrir Media Office, 'Hizb-Ut-Tahrir Media Office', 2023, <https://www.hizb-ut-tahrir.info/en/>.

¹² Hizb ut-Tahrir, *Hizb Ut-Tahrir* (Hizb ut Tahrir, 1953), https://www.hizb-ut-tahrir.org/PDF/EN/en_books_pdf/12_Hizb_ut_Tahrir.pdf.

¹³ Taqiuddin An-Nabahani, *The System of Islam* (London: Al-Khilafah Publications, 2002).

the rights of the people, refuse to fulfill their obligations to the people or neglect any issues within their purview, thereby violating Islamic law¹⁴.

Since its establishment, Hizb ut-Tahrir has spread to around forty countries, both in a state of being allowed to operate freely or banned by governments. HT has branches in Europe, America, Australia, Asia, and Africa. However, thirteen countries have banned HT as an organization and repressed its members. Indonesia was the most recent country to disband HT in 2017¹⁵.

Criticism of Hizbut Tahrir on the Issue of Capitalism

According to HT, only three ideologies exist in the world today: Capitalism, Socialism, Communism, and Islam. Each of the first two ideologies is embraced by one or several countries. Meanwhile, the third ideology, Islam, is not adopted by any particular nation. Individuals within the society embrace Islam. Nevertheless, this ideology remains present throughout the world. Capitalism is founded on the separation of religion from life (secularism). This idea serves as its creed (principle), as well as its ideological leadership (*qiyadah fikriyah*) and its cognitive principle (*qaidah fikriyah*).

Based on this cognitive principle, they argue that humans have the right to establish their way of life. They uphold human freedoms, including the freedom of belief, expression, property rights, and personal freedom. From the freedom of property rights arises the capitalist economic system, which is a prominent aspect of this ideology or produced by the belief in this ideology. Therefore, this ideology is called the ideology of capitalism. A name derived from the most prominent aspect of this ideology.

Democracy, embraced by this ideology, stems from its perspective that humans have the right to create laws. According to them, the people are the source of power. The people create legislation.

¹⁴ Hizb ut-Tahrir, *Hizb Ut-Tahrir*.

¹⁵ Counterextremism.com, 'Hizb Ut-Tahrir', *Counterextremism*, 2018, <https://www.counterextremism.com/threat/hizb-ut-tahrir>.

The people pay the head of state to execute their created laws. The people have the right to withdraw this power from the head of state, replacing them and amending laws according to their desires. This is because power in the democratic system is a work contract between the people and the head of state, who is paid to govern according to the laws created by the people.

Although democracy originates from the ideology of this ideology, it is less prominent compared to its economic system. The proof is that the Western capitalist system significantly influences the power elites (government), making them submissive to capitalists (owners of capital). It can even be said that capitalists are the real rulers in countries that adhere to this ideology. Besides, democracy is not a distinctive feature of this ideology, as communists also advocate for it, asserting that power lies in the hands of the people. Therefore, it is more accurate to call this ideology the ideology of capitalism¹⁶.

From an economic-political perspective, HT criticizes capitalism for making the concept of all resources in a country freely owned by individuals, including agricultural land, plantations, mines, and other public facilities. According to HT, this can prevent the public from easily obtaining their interests and even make it more difficult—for example, oil, which is currently essential for the economy. If controlled by private entities rather than the state, oil would become a commodity for business interests. This can affect various economic processes within society because oil is used in various industries, including transportation.

HT also criticizes capitalist economic management, which makes utility the guiding principle, blurring the line between halal (permissible) and haram (forbidden). For instance, the buying and selling of alcohol, the commodification of women's bodies, and other usurious economic transactions such as banking, limited liability companies, cooperatives, and more.

Regarding distribution, HT criticizes capitalism for making the market the sole means of wealth distribution. According to HT, this would allow only those with sufficient wealth to access specific facilities or goods—for example, hospital services, schools, universities, etc.

HT's view on Islamic economic politics is based on Islamic beliefs. According to HT, human economic activities must always be based on Islamic rules, including property ownership, management, and wealth distribution.

¹⁶ An-Nabahani, *The System of Islam*.

Regarding ownership, Islam has the concepts of public, individual, and state ownership. Public ownership means all economic resources for public welfare, and if controlled by a few people, it would make life difficult for the public. Examples include roads, air, sea, and unlimited natural resources such as oil, gas, coal, and gold. Individual ownership is related to goods or services not essential to the livelihood of many, such as a car driver, barbers, agriculture, factories, and other businesses. State ownership includes taxes, kharaj (land tax), ghanimah (spoils of war), fai (state property), and other sources of state income.

In terms of wealth management, HT explains that in Islam, a Muslim must adhere to Sharia laws, such as dealing with halal goods and services, while avoiding what is haram. Islam allows buying and selling, prohibits usury, fraud, and hoarding of wealth, permits partnerships, and more.

Regarding wealth distribution, Islam regulates distribution directly or through market mechanisms. Direct distribution involves providing the obligation of livelihood for a head of the family to their family or the state directly distributing to society related to the results of public property, such as health, education, and transportation. Meanwhile, distribution through the market involves secondary or tertiary goods or services ¹⁷.

Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia

Hizb ut-Tahrir in Indonesia was first introduced in the 1980s after Abdullah bin Nuh invited Abdurrahman al-Baghdadi to come to Indonesia. Abdullah bin Nuh is a prominent Islamic scholar living in Bogor, West Java, who established an Islamic Boarding School (*pesantren*) called al-Ghazali. Bin Nuh met with HT's members, mostly from the Middle East, when he visited his son, who studied in Australia. Later, bin Nuh invited Abdurrahman al-Baghdadi and facilitated the dissemination of HT's ideas in Indonesia. Al-Baghdadi went to Indonesia in 1982, making Nuh's school his base. Baghdadi then became a prominent Islamic figure and preacher, especially in some campus Muslim groups like the Bogor Agricultural

¹⁷ Taqiuddin an-Nabhani, *The Economic System of Islam*, Sixth Edition (London: Hizb ut Tahrir, 2004).

Institute (Institut Pertanian Bogor), the Bandung Institute of Technology (Institut Teknologi Bandung) and the University of Indonesia (UI) ¹⁸.

In the 1990s, HT's members started to work outside the universities after many members graduated. HT initiated a study circle in Jakarta Standard Chartered Islamic Study Circle (Kelompok Studi Islam Standard Chartered – KSICC) in Wisma Standard Chartered Bank. HT arranged talks, study circles, seminars, and training there. In 1994, HT published its bulletin *Al-Islam* and distributed it at mosques in Jakarta. Later, this bulletin became nationally distributed. Through this bulletin, HT organized a discussion regarding the content of *al-Islam*. This forum was then halted after being forced to stop by authorities due to one article criticizing Indonesia's central bank ¹⁹.

By 1998, Indonesia turned into a more democratic country after 32 years under the authoritarian system led by General Soeharto. This change gave Indonesian people a new political opportunity to express their political ideas freely and set up political or social groups and communities. HT was included to get the impact of this political change. But HT declared its existence formally after two years of Reformasi, 2000. This declaration was proclaimed at the First International Conference in August 2000, attended by around 2000-3000 people in Senayan Tennis Stadium, Jakarta, and attended by international speakers Ismail al-Wahwah (HT Australia) and Dr. Sharifuddin Md Zain (HT Malaysia). Many members of HT from other countries, including Australia, Malaysia, Jordan, and Britain, also attended this event. This conference became a declaration that HT will step from the first stage (culturing and organizing) to the second stage (interacting with the *ummah*) of the three stages to achieve its political goal.

The active movement of HTI to engage the Indonesian public impacted the increase in the Indonesian recognition of this group. For example, in 2004, HTI received legal recognition from the government through Certification of Registration from the Indonesian Ministry of Home Affairs. Also, in 2014, HTI obtained legal status from the Indonesian Ministry of Law and Human Rights. Besides, HTI was welcomed by Indonesian Islamic groups through the acceptance of HTI figures as members of the Indonesian Ulema Council from 2005 to 2010 ²⁰.

¹⁸ Greg Fealy, 'Hizbut Tahrir in Indonesia: Seeking A Total Islamic Identity', in *Islam and Political Violence: Muslim Diaspora and Radicalism in the West*, ed. Shahram Akbarzadeh and Fethi Mansouri (New York: Tauris Academic Studies, 2007), 155.

¹⁹ Mohamed Nawab Mohamed Osman, *Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia and Political Islam Identity, Ideology and Religio-Political Mobilization* (New York: Routledge, 2018), 56.

²⁰ Abdurakhman Ilhamdi, 'Gerakan Politik Islam Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia (HTI): Transformasi Menuju Pengakuan Resmi Pemerintah (2000-2006)', lib.ui.ac.id, 2015, <http://lib.ui.ac.id/naskahringkas/2018-10/S59449-Ilhamdi>; Office of Assistant to Deputy Cabinet Secretary for State Documents & Translation, 'Government Disbands HTI

From 2000 until 2017, Hizb ut-Tahrir has organized hundreds of events, demonstrations, talks, seminars, conferences and published media and books. These are part of HTI's strategies in the second stage of its da`wa activities to win the hearts and minds of the Muslim people in Indonesia and support the idea of sharia and Khilafah.

In July 2017, the state revoked the legal status of HTI for several reasons: HTI was deemed not to play a positive role in participating in the development process to achieve the Indonesian national goals. HTI is also contrary to the Indonesian ideology, Panca,sila, and the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. Besides, the activities carried out by HTI are considered to have caused conflicts that can threaten public security and order and endanger the Unity of the Republic of Indonesia.

The state issued the policy after receiving demands from several Islamic groups, including *Nahdlatul Ulama*, to dissolve HTI. On July 19, 2017, the Indonesian Ministry of Law and Human Rights finally declared revoking the legal status of HTI based on an extraordinary law to respond to HTI called *Perppu Ormas 2017* (government in lieu of law on the social organization). This policy changed the course of HTI's history, which was previously very free to have limited political movement in Indonesia ²¹.

Anti-Capitalism Narratives of HTI

In the view of HTI, a fundamental flaw in the current application of the capitalist economic system in Indonesia is that efforts to eradicate poverty focus solely on increasing production, both the total production of the country and per capita income, rather than addressing distribution issues. Therefore, the capitalist economic system will never be able to solve the problem of poverty because the central issue, wealth distribution, is not organized as it should be. As a result, successive governments, including those in Indonesia, consistently emphasize their perspective on production growth and increased average income per capita

After Receiving Input from Ulemas and the People Oleh: ; Diposkan Pada: 19 Jul 2017', setkab.go.id, 2017, <https://setkab.go.id/en/government-disbands-hti-after-receiving-i>; Fahlesa Munabari, 'Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia: The Rhetorical Struggle for Survival', in *Islam in Contention: Rethinking Islam and State in Indonesia*, ed. Ota Atsushi, Okamoto Masaaki, and Ahmad Suaedy (Jakarta: Wahid Institute-CSEAS-CAPAS, 2010), 169–213.

²¹ Kristian Erdianto, 'Ini Alasan Pemerintah Bubarkan Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia', *kompas*, 2017, <http://nasional.kompas.com/read/2017/05/08/14382891/ini.alasan.pemerintah.bubarkan.hizbut.tahrir.indonesia>.

without paying attention to how wealth is fairly distributed within society. Over time, with the increasing production, wealth has accumulated in the hands of a few individuals. The powerful accumulate more wealth through their strength, while the weak become increasingly deprived due to their inherent vulnerabilities²².

According to HTI, from an economic perspective, the state must ensure that economic activities, including the production, distribution, and consumption of goods and services, comply with Sharia regulations and that no party is involved in oppression. Therefore, Islam establishes laws related to economic activities (production, industry, agriculture, distribution, and trade), investment, currency, taxation, etc., allowing everyone to access wealth without harming or harming others. Additionally, the state uses non-economic distribution patterns to distribute wealth to those who have not economically gained wealth through instruments such as zakat, sadaqah, grants, and state assistance. This way, economically disadvantaged parties are not further marginalized²³.

In the Indonesian context, HTI criticizes Indonesia's economic system, which relies on economic growth. Although, for example, economic growth has increased, it does not impact improving the quality of society. In fact, the gap is still high among the community. Making economic growth a benchmark for the economic quality of a country, according to HTI, is an illusion because economic growth is the average calculation of production divided by the number of citizens as a whole. Using the method, a handful of rich people whose wealth is shared with the whole society will look positive even though the reality is not so²⁴.

In managing natural resources, HTI argues that the capitalist economic system provides opportunities for domestic and foreign private companies to profit from a country's natural resources through concession permits for mining, logging rights, or other privileges. Private companies enjoy more benefits from natural resources while the public faces difficulties. After privatization, there will undoubtedly be price increases—a way for private companies to maximize profits.

²² Hizbut Tahrir, *Manifesto Hizbut Tahrir Untuk Indonesia 'Indonesia, Khalifah, Dan Penyatuan Kembali Daulah Islam'* (Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia, 2009).

²³ Julian Sigit, 'Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Dan Kesejahteraan', *Al-Wa'ie* (blog), 23 October 2021, <https://alwaie.net/analisis/pertumbuhan-ekonomi-dan-kesejahteraan/>.

²⁴ Sigit.

As the owner, according to HTI, the entire population should benefit from these natural resources. Therefore, the state must manage these resources to the best of its ability, possibly through state-owned enterprises (BUMN), for the welfare of the people. The state should not at all surrender the assets of natural resources to private entities. This action is equivalent to handing over something that does not belong to them to others, which would undoubtedly harm the true owner—the people²⁵.

Regarding taxation, HTI believes that the state's main income comes from taxes in the capitalist system. The state will continue to try to increase tax revenue so that the so-called development costs continue to rise. Various efforts are ongoing to create new tax objects and tax mechanisms. As a result, the people are increasingly burdened. Income tax erodes the salaries and income of the people; sales tax increases the burden of spending on various essential needs, including food and medicines, while taxes on oil strangle industrialists and farmers.

According to HTI, Islam has its way of organizing state revenue. This includes income from common ownership, such as oil and gas; from the agricultural sector, such as *kharaj*; from the industrial sector, such as zakat on merchandise, etc. Thus, the Caliphate can obtain substantial revenue while stimulating extraordinary economic activity. Concerning taxes, Islam liberates people from oppressive tax burdens. Even if there is a tax, it is collected from those categorized as wealthy and for Muslims only and is temporary until the funding needs are met²⁶.

HTI stated through the proper and consistent implementation of the Islamic economic system, the Baitul Maal (treasury) of the Caliphate is believed to be able to accumulate sufficient funds. Subsequently, these funds will be used to finance development, especially in sectors falling under the term Public Service Obligation (PSO), such as education, health, and infrastructure (roads, bridges, electricity, water, telephone, etc.). Khilafah will also fund heavy industries, such as arms and steel, and large projects, such as dam construction and

²⁵ Indra Fajar Alamsyah, 'Pengelolaan Tambang Sesuai Syariah', *Al-Wa'ie* (blog), 28 November 2021, <https://alwaie.net/analisis/pengelolaan-tambang-sesuai-syariah/>.

²⁶ Muis, 'Pajak Dalam Kapitalisme Dan Islam', *Al-Wa'ie* (blog), 24 April 2023, <https://alwaie.net/iqtishadiyah/pajak-dalam-kapitalisme-dan-islam/>.

telecommunications networks nationwide. Additionally, interest-free loans will stimulate people's economic activities and provide state aid for those in need. This can be realized without involving foreign investment or loans ²⁷.

HTI considers that Islam fundamentally does not prohibit individuals, companies, and states from borrowing money from others. However, loans must be without interest and should not be from colonial states or international institutions such as the IMF, World Bank, and others that could be tools for foreign states to dominate the Islamic world ²⁸.

To apply all economic systems in Islam, both in terms of natural resource management and state income, including the fulfillment of community social services, must also go through the state determined by Islam, namely the caliphate, because only this country is based on Islam and functions to implement sharia laws. This differs from democracy under the guise of the people's interests. Still, in reality, it is widely used by the interests of both domestic and foreign capital owners for their interests. Because, according to HTI, along with the concentration of wealth in a few people (oligarchs), it will be easier for them to influence various political processes, including making laws through political parties, the media, lobbying, elections, and other channels. According to HTI, the strength of the Caliphate over democracy is that in the caliphate, the law comes from sharia, the law is enforced fairly regardless of the status of a person's wealth, and the economic system in Islam separates resources that regulate individual, public and state ownership ²⁹.

Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia

HTM (Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia) began as a student movement and was founded in Malaysia by a group of educated graduates, many of whom were alumni of universities such as Imperial College London, the University of Sheffield, and the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS). These students were recruited by Mohammad Azree, a Malaysian citizen

²⁷ Yuli Sarwanto, 'Konsep APBN Dalam Islam', *Al-Wa'ie* (blog), 18 September 2021, <https://alwaie.net/opini/konsep-apbn-dalam-islam/>.

²⁸ Hizbut Tahrir, *Manifesto Hizbut Tahrir Untuk Indonesia 'Indonesia, Khalifah, Dan Penyatuan Kembali Daulah Islam'*.

²⁹ Muis, 'Demokrasi Menyuburkan Oligarki', *Al-Wa'ie* (blog), 23 April 2022, <https://alwaie.net/iqtishadiyah/demokrasi-menyuburkan-oligarki/>.

married to a British citizen working at an engineering company in the UK. Most of those recruited had educational backgrounds, primarily in engineering and science.

These students brought HT's ideology to Malaysia in the late 1990s when they returned and began conducting *halaqahs* (discussion circles) through an underground movement, using various student fronts and organizations to avoid government surveillance. With the assistance of members of Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia, they consolidated the movement in late 1997 and officially established Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia in 2004.

The recruitment of HTM members has continued to follow the same trend. Most recruits tend to be dominated by university students and academics, educated professionals, and individuals from the upper-middle-class income group.

In September 2020, authorities in the state of Johor, southern Malaysia, issued a fatwa declaring Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia (HTM) as haram (illegal). State police launched an investigation into the group for alleged public disobedience and incitement of racial disharmony, with authorities threatening the use of anti-terrorism laws if they "cross security limits." While HTM has not been banned at the federal level, it has been declared illegal in five states: Selangor, Kuala Lumpur, Negeri Sembilan, Sabah, and Johor. HTM members have been arrested in the past for insulting religious officials, and the government has consistently rejected their requests to register officially as a society.

Despite being banned in various regions, HTM does not resist through violence. HTM is actively preaching online, spreading its ideology and writings through social media. The group actively participates in preaching campaigns and holds regular seminars and discussions virtually and physically. The group is also involved in several demonstrations. In 2015, HTM held two public demonstrations: the first condemning Charlie Hebdo for its controversial publication shortly after the terrorist attack on its office, and the second opposing the visit of then-US President Barack Obama to Kuala Lumpur. In December 2019, HTM organized

another demonstration in the city to protest China's treatment of Uighur Muslims and called on Malaysians to prepare for jihad against China to save the Uighur people³⁰.

HTM's View on Capitalism in Malaysia

The issues in Malaysia, such as social inequality, poverty, and *ribawi* / interest-based economic transactions, are seen as part of implementing capitalism in the country. Capitalism leads society to adopt standards of happiness based on utility, causing many to fall into a consumeristic culture and face bankruptcy.

In 2019, HTM quoted the Economic Monitoring Study Report Malaysia 2019, which explained that 60% of those facing bankruptcy were from the millennial generation, aged 25-44. According to HTM, those experiencing bankruptcy are trapped in a materialistic mindset that compels them to fulfill desires by relying on *ribawi* debts, ultimately leading to their financial ruin.

Such an attitude, according to HTM, contradicts Islamic principles, which should guide individuals always to base their economic activities on Sharia standards. This is expected to save young people from *riba* practices that lead to impoverishment³¹.

In response to the issue of COVID-19, the high number of poor people in Malaysia, especially workers from Pakistan, Bangladesh, and India living in densely populated apartment buildings, increases the potential for the spread of COVID-19. According to HTM, this situation results from the flaws in the system implemented in Malaysia, particularly the capitalist system that consistently favors the wealthy. Meanwhile, the urban poor reside in crowded and inadequate areas. COVID-19 could worsen the situation and spread due to poorly addressed poverty.

According to HTI, in Islam, every individual should be guaranteed basic needs such as food, clothing, and shelter, and Islam also ensures health, safety, and free education for its citizens. Anyone can become a citizen of the Islamic state, regardless of their race or origin,

³⁰ Rueben Ananthan Santhana Dass and Jasminder Singh, 'Hizbut Tahrir in Malaysia: A Threat to National Security?', Middle East Institute, 29 June 2021, <https://www.mei.edu/publications/hizbut-tahrir-malaysia-threat-national-security/>.

³¹ Nasran Sulaiman, '60 Peratus Muflis Golongan Muda, Natijah Sistem Kapitalisme', *Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia* (blog), 4 January 2020, <https://mykhalifah.com/60-peratus-muflis-golongan-muda-natijah-sistem-kapitalisme/>.

especially for those who choose it, and even more so for those who are Muslims because every Muslim is considered a brother, and every Islamic territory has the right to be their place of residence.

According to HTM, Muslims will always be in a disadvantaged position as long as the capitalist system is applied to them. This is because the government and the capitalist owners who dominate the politics and economy of the country will always strive to maintain a system of disbelief that favors them ³².

In the context of the democratic political system in Malaysia, according to HTM, this system continuously suppresses the society with various problems without providing concrete solutions from the government. Meanwhile, the government sometimes offers solutions that do not address the issues but appease the anger of the people struggling in the narrow gaps of life.

According to HTM, this occurs despite several changes in government elites. These elites often make political promises to the public before getting elected, but the community is neglected once they win. Government policies serve the ruling elite's interests and supporting parties only.

HTM argues that the democratic system in Malaysia contradicts Islam because it encroaches upon Allah's (*swt*) right as the Lawgiver (*Musyarri'*). Every law or regulation needs to be discussed in parliament, including matters related to Islamic Sharia. For example, to implement hudud (Islamic penalties), only the votes of parliament members are required.

According to HTM, democracy also incurs excessively high costs in each election. A new election must be held if a representative passes away, incurring significant expenses. What is even more regrettable, according to HTM, is the Islamic movements that adopt democracy, with some even supporting and cooperating with secular parties. HTM warns that when Islamic

³² Yusuf M, 'Sistem Kapitalisme Memburukkan Penyebaran Covid-19', *Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia* (blog), 14 April 2020, <https://mykhilafah.com/sistem-kapitalisme-memburukkan-penyebaran-covid-19/>.

movements engage in democratic processes, they risk falling into the trap of a system designed to marginalize Islam from governance³³.

In the context of the perspective of framing in social movements, first, by using the Hizb ut-Tahrir diagnostic approach, Indonesia and Malaysia view capitalism as the root of the problems that occur in Indonesia and Malaysia both in terms of democracy, which gives birth to politicians who ignore the interests of the community and tend to side with their political interests with the oligarchs. The economy is also designed for the benefit of capitalists who ignore the interests of the majority of society.

From the prognostic side, both HTI and HTM view that the solution to the capitalist problem that occurs is through the application of Islamic sharia through all aspects of state life, both in terms of the political system, economic system, legal system, education system, and other state systems. According to HT, this path is of kindness, justice, and community welfare.

In terms of motivation, HTI and HTM always invite countries in the world, including Muslims, to abandon the capitalist system and apply Islamic sharia in all aspects of people's lives.

CONCLUSION

Globally, Hizbut Tahrir is known as a group that advocates for Islam as the foundational principle of statehood and civilization. According to HT, Islam can only be implemented through a strong state apparatus that functions to uphold Sharia law and lead the propagation of Islamic teachings worldwide.

HT believes that all aspects of life should be governed by Islam, from individual matters to state affairs and international relations. If Muslims do not adhere to and apply Islamic teachings, HT contends that their lives will suffer in social, economic, political, and other aspects. Based on these ideas, HT rejects all concepts and philosophies that do not originate from the Islamic intellectual tradition, such as liberalism, socialism, nationalism, and others.

³³ Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia, 'Cengkaman Kapitalisme Dan Demokrasi Di Malaysia, Sampai Bila?', *Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia* (blog), 11 May 2021, <https://mykhilafah.com/cengkaman-kapitalisme-dan-demokrasi-di-malaysia-sampai-bila/>.

In the economic context, HT sees the concept of ownership, management, and distribution of wealth based on the market as creating disparities and exploitation in society. Private individuals freely own natural resources that should belong to the public and be for the public's benefit. On the other hand, a benefit-based approach to wealth management leads to the commodification of various economic aspects, including the exploitation of prohibited items such as food, drinks, and certain clothing styles. Regarding distribution, relying on market mechanisms means not everyone in society can access their needs, as everything must be exchanged for money. According to HT, for the economy to function justly, it must follow Islamic economic policies regarding ownership, management, and distribution.

HT's global stance is mirrored by its branches in Indonesia and Malaysia. The difference lies in the specific issues in each country. However, the response and solution to all problems are identical: attributing the issues in both Malaysia and Indonesia to the implementation of capitalism and advocating for Islamic principles through the establishment of Sharia and the caliphate.

REFERENCES

- Ahnaf, Mohammad Iqbal. 'Hizb Al-Tahrir: Its Ideology and Theory for Collective Radicalization'. In *Expressions of Radicalization: Global Politics, Processes and Practices*, edited by Kristian Steiner and Andreas Önnersfors, 295–320. Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-65566-6_11.
- Alamsyah, Indra Fajar. 'Pengelolaan Tambang Sesuai Syariah'. *Al-Wa'ie* (blog), 28 November 2021. <https://alwaie.net/analisis/pengelolaan-tambang-sesuai-syariah/>.
- Ali, Jan A., and Elisa Orofino. 'Islamic Revivalist Movements in the Modern World: An Analysis of al-Ikhwān al-Muslimūn, Tabligh Jama'at, and Hizb Ut-Tahrir'. *Journal for the Academic Study of Religion* 31, no. 1 (2018): 27–54. <https://doi.org/10.1558/jasr.35051>.
- An-Nabahani, Taqiuddin. *The System of Islam*. London: Al-Khilafah Publications, 2002.
- Aswar, Hasbi. 'Destructing The Islamism in Indonesia'. *International Journal of Malay-Nusantara Studies* 1, no. 1 (2018): 62–79.
- Benford, Robert D, and David A Snow. 'Framing Processes and Social Movements: An Overview and Assessment'. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 2000. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.soc.26.1.611>.
- Counterextremism.com. 'Hizb Ut-Tahrir'. *Counterextremism*, 2018. <https://www.counterextremism.com/threat/hizb-ut-tahrir>.
- Dass, Rueben Ananthan Santhana, and Jasminder Singh. 'Hizbut Tahrir in Malaysia: A Threat to National Security?' Middle East Institute, 29 June 2021. <https://www.mei.edu/publications/hizbut-tahrir-malaysia-threat-national-security>.
- Erdianto, Kristian. 'Ini Alasan Pemerintah Bubarkan Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia'. *kompas*, 2017. <http://nasional.kompas.com/read/2017/05/08/14382891/ini.alasan.pemerintah.bubarkan.hizbut.tahrir.indonesia>.

- Fealy, Greg. 'Hizbut Tahrir in Indonesia: Seeking A Total Islamic Identity'. In *Islam and Political Violence: Muslim Diaspora and Radicalism in the West*, edited by Shahram Akbarzadeh and Fethi Mansouri, 151–64. New York: Tauris Academic Studies, 2007.
- Hadiz, Vedi R. 'Indonesian Political Islam: Capitalist Development and the Legacies of the Cold War'. *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs* 30, no. 1 (2011): 3–38. <https://doi.org/10.1177/186810341103000101>.
- Hizb ut-Tahrir. *Hizb Ut-Tahrir*. Hizb ut Tahrir, 1953. https://www.hizb-ut-tahrir.org/PDF/EN/en_books_pdf/12_Hizb_ut_Tahrir.pdf.
- Hizbut Tahrir. *Manifesto Hizbut Tahrir Untuk Indonesia 'Indonesia, Khalifah, Dan Penyatuan Kembali Daulah Islam'*. Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia, 2009.
- Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia. 'Cengkaman Kapitalisme Dan Demokrasi Di Malaysia, Sampai Bila?' *Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia* (blog), 11 May 2021. <https://mykhalifah.com/cengkaman-kapitalisme-dan-demokrasi-di-malaysia-sampai-bila/>.
- Hizb-ut-Tahrir Media Office. 'Hizb-Ut-Tahrir Media Office', 2023. <https://www.hizb-ut-tahrir.info/en/>.
- Ilhamdi, Abdurakhman. 'Gerakan Politik Islam Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia (HTI): Transformasi Menuju Pengakuan Resmi Pemerintah (2000-2006)'. lib.ui.ac.id, 2015. <http://lib.ui.ac.id/naskahringkas/2018-10/S59449-Ilhamdi>.
- Moghadam, Valentine M. *Globalization and Social Movements Islamism, Feminism, and the Global Justice Movement*. United Kingdom: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2009.
- Muis. 'Demokrasi Menyuburkan Oligarki'. *Al-Wa'ie* (blog), 23 April 2022. <https://alwaie.net/iqtishadiyah/demokrasi-menyuburkan-oligharki/>.

- . ‘Pajak Dalam Kapitalisme Dan Islam’. *Al-Wa’ie* (blog), 24 April 2023. <https://alwaie.net/iqtishadiyah/pajak-dalam-kapitalisme-dan-islam/>.
- Munabari, Fahlesa. ‘Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia: The Rhetorical Struggle for Survival’. In *Islam in Contention: Rethinking Islam and State in Indonesia*, edited by Ota Atsushi, Okamoto Masaaki, and Ahmad Suaedy, 169–213. Jakarta: Wahid Institute-CSEAS-CAPAS, 2010.
- Nabhani, Taquiuddin an-. *The Economic System of Islam*. Sixth Edition. London: Hizb ut Tahrir, 2004.
- Office of Assistant to Deputy Cabinet Secretary for State Documents & Translation. ‘Government Disbands HTI After Receiving Input from Ulemas and the People Oleh ; ; Diposkan Pada: 19 Jul 2017’. setkab.go.id, 2017. <https://setkab.go.id/en/government-disbands-hti-after-receiving-i>.
- Olsson, Susanne. ‘Hizb Ut-Tahrir’s Caliphal Counter-Narrative’. *Religions* 2021, Vol. 12, Page 486 12, no. 7 (29 June 2021): 486. <https://doi.org/10.3390/REL12070486>.
- Osman, Mohamed Nawab Mohamed. *Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia and Political Islam: Identity, Ideology and Religio-Political Mobilization*. *Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia and Political Islam: Identity, Ideology and Religio-Political Mobilization*. New York: Routledge, 2018. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351240222>.
- . *Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia and Political Islam Identity, Ideology and Religio-Political Mobilization*. New York: Routledge, 2018.
- . ‘Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia: The Emergence of a New Transnational Islamist Movement in Malaysia’. *Al-Jami’ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 47, no. 1 (26 June 2009): 91–110. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2009.471.91-110>.
- Sarwanto, Yuli. ‘Konsep APBN Dalam Islam’. *Al-Wa’ie* (blog), 18 September 2021. <https://alwaie.net/opini/konsep-apbn-dalam-islam/>.

Sigit, Julian. 'Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Dan Kesejahteraan'. *Al-Wa'ie* (blog), 23 October 2021.

<https://alwaie.net/analisis/pertumbuhan-ekonomi-dan-kesejahteraan/>.

Sulaiman, Nasran. '60 Peratus Mufliis Golongan Muda, Natijah Sistem Kapitalisme'. *Hizbut*

Tahrir Malaysia (blog), 4 January 2020. <https://mykhalifah.com/60-peratus-mufliis-golongan-muda-natijah-sistem-kapitalisme/>.

Yusuf M. 'Sistem Kapitalisme Memburukkan Penyebaran Covid-19'. *Hizbut Tahrir Malaysia*

(blog), 14 April 2020. <https://mykhalifah.com/sistem-kapitalisme-memburukkan-penyebaran-covid-19/>.